

to control greenhouse gas emissions and minimize global warming.

#### D. Partnership with Government Agencies on Environmental Protection

Mt. Talama is a private property, but partnered with the government agencies to be a way to make the place more beautiful or to improve the tourism site, in general. Specifically, Mt. Talama is subdivided into two (2) ownerships where the first half of the area is donated to the government, while the other half is a private property. According to the caretakers, with their partnership with the Local Government Unit-Municipal Tourism Office, this can also be a way to help them promote the destination to the public. It further specified that these collaborations with government agencies promote and encourage visitors to come to Mt. Talama.

Some of the verbalizations are as follows:

*Informant 1: "Bagi ni Apo councilor ngy dytoy ket naki partner da iti Tourism office tapnu milng maipromote dytuy nga place"* (This park is owned by Mr. Councilor and they've partnered with the Tourism Office which can also be a way of promoting this place).

*Informant 5: "Ada ngy ti partnership da jay Tourism tapno metlang matulungan nga pumintas pay daytoy nga karkaro"* (They have a tourism partnership which will help them beautify the area even more).

Similarly, partnership with the government is also verified as part of their sustainability practices in Mt. Talama. Respondents said that they had a collaboration with the government, particularly the Municipal Tourism Office, to help them improve the area. The informants also mentioned that their partnership with the government helped them promote and encourage the public to come and visit the said destination. This implies that through partnership, they can be able to improve and sustain more the attraction to become a better place for people who need relaxation and a quiet place to relieve stress. According to new research, they included development partnerships, which are typically contracts or joint ventures formed by local governments and private developers to promote a specific development with mutual benefits (Bailey, Barker & MacDonald, 1995). According to new research, this finding substantiates that public-private partnership is an agreement between the public and private sectors to finance, design, develop, operate, and protect public infrastructure, community facilities, and related services (Ribeiro & Dantas, 2006).

#### Theme 2: Challenges on the Implementation of Environmental Sustainability Practices of Mt. Talama

##### A. Non-Compliance of Visitors to Environmental Laws and Policies

One of the key characteristics of Mt. Talama is visitors' discipline in obeying the environmental laws and policies, which, according to the caretakers, has had an impact on the area. According to the informants, visitors who do not follow the laws and policies will face the consequences such as calling their attention and being reminded of their actions, not being allowed to return to the site, and being dismissed. According to the informants, these obstacles encourage and inspire them to willingly improve the location, ensuring that the ecosystem is not harmed. This shows that the caretakers in Mt. Talama are guided with appropriate actions to minimize undisciplined visitors so that Mt. Talama will not be threatened. As a continuation of noncompliance of the visitors to environmental laws and policies, it usually results in improper waste disposal. As mentioned by the caretakers, they have been stressed about the waste of the visitors, which contributes to the negative impact on the environment. Aside from that, they used their personal motorcycle to throw the garbage, instead of having a private dumptruck to collect it for safer transport. Moreover, some visitors do not understand that the caretakers' jobs can be hazardous because of continuously throwing their garbage incorrectly; it might have possible implications for the environment in the future, such as floods and air pollution. The visitors' lack of understanding of the consequences of improper waste disposal may affect the caretakers' safety and the environment, as a whole.

Some of the verbalizations are as follows:

*Informant 2: "marigatan kami iti panagdisciplina ti bisita ta ibelleng da latta jy wara da ury nu adda met ti makitkita da nga basuraan ijay abay da. Siguro masadut da nga apan ibelleng nu medyo adayu jy basuraan kanyada."* (It's difficult to discipline visitors when it comes to their waste. Even if the trash bin is right in front of them, they won't put it there. Perhaps, they're too lazy to throw their trash when the trash bin is far away).

*Informant 3: "Mapan da py latta ijay private house ket maiparit kuma ti mapan ijay ngem nasulpeng da latta. Sursuratan da pay jy idig sunga nu makita yu ket adda ti sursurat na ijay padpader."* (Despite the fact that it is a private house, they insist on going. As you can see, they also write various things at the house's corner).

*Informant 4: "Ken dagituy dadduma pay nga um umay dituy ket haan da kuma met nga agiyum umay ti mainom nga arak ken sigarilyo ta maipairit"*. (Also, some people should not bring alcohol or cigarettes into the area because it is prohibited).

*Informant 5: "Maysa nga challenges kanyami nga caretaker ket jy panagusar mi ti sarili mi nga motorcycle nu apan mi ibelleng dagijy basura"*. (Our one problem is we don't have any garbage truck. We use our personal service to collect and throw all the garbage).

*Informant 8: "Adu ti stress gapu dita pagibilling da iti basura. Ta uray kititaen da jy basuraan ijay abay da iwara da lattan". (We encountered a lot of stress because of their improper throwing of garbages. They've already seen the garbage bins but still they throw it anywhere).*

On the other hand, the respondents in the study also mentioned the challenges that they had encountered when implementing the above-mentioned practices. The respondents' most common responses to the problems they face when implementing environmental sustainability policies are the discipline of tourists in following the laws and policies, improper waste disposal, lack of garbage trucks to be used, and insufficient funds. The respondents said that visitors were difficult to discipline, vandalized the private property house, and brought alcohol and cigarettes inside the area. This denotes that, even though the caretakers placed trash bins in various areas where visitors can properly dispose of their waste, there are still visitors who do not dispose of their garbage properly. As a result, they are forced to strictly enforce certain laws and policies in order to avoid undisciplined visitors to the site. The study of Mansbridge (2014) affirms that implementing environmental policies can protect the environment directly or solve environmental collective action problems. Similarly, the absence of dumptrucks for the proper collection of waste disposal in Mt. Talama provides risk since these caretakers are using their personal motorcycles to transport garbage in order to maintain the place. This signifies that the caretakers' job is unsafe and may affect their productivity because it might have possible implications for their future health, safety, and security. The unfitting way of collecting this waste disposal among the caretakers is indeed alarming if not addressed immediately with appropriate measures.

#### B. Lack of funds for the materials needed to sustain the place

Lack of funds is a problem that occurs when a company's capital is insufficient to meet a payment demand. The informants have stated that they do not have enough funds to maintain the necessary materials when performing the abovementioned practices. This suggests that Mt. Talama only had a limited number of resources to put in place their sustainability practices.

The verbalization is as follows:

*Informant 3: "ken maysa py nga problema mi ket awan ti pondo nga mang patakder kuma kadagijy dadduma py nga practices" (And one of the problems that we encounter is that we don't have enough funds to implement other practices).*

As stated by the informant, there was an insufficient fund to sustain the site. These are the materials needed such as sacks to serve as garbage bags, stick brooms and solar panels. Therefore, in the study of Sourani & Sohail (2011), one of the

impediments to addressing sustainability in construction procurement is the lack of funding.

#### Theme 3: Coping Mechanisms to address the challenges

##### A. Implementation of Environmental Laws

Environmental laws are intended to safeguard the environment. They have implemented several norms and policies to protect the environment, as stated by the caretakers. If a visitor is identified for breaking one (1) of these laws, they will be penalized such as banning them to return to the place or dismissing them. The environment remains to be safeguarded rather than harmed by humans which further suggests that in order to protect the environment, such laws must be strictly enforced.

By imposing penalties and punishment, there is a tendency that visitors may not repeat their violations. According to the caretakers, visitors who are found out not abiding by the policies of Mt. Talama will have penalties; however, their punishment will then be dependent on their violations. They will be given their first offense penalty; when it's really bad, they will be forced to be provided with punishment. This means that the caretakers of Mt. Talama are aware of their policies and implement them to safeguard Mt. Talama. Moreover, it is further noted that the fees and other collections are being kept and used for sustainability-related expenses. If there are any violations committed by visitors, fees will be collected in accordance with their violations and added to their funds.

Some of the verbalizations are as follows:

*Informant 1: "Nu man adda ti matiliw nga bisita nga haan sumursurut ti patakaran ket hanen mapasrek." (If a visitor is found to be violating the policies, he or she will not be allowed to return).*

*Informant 4: "Nu adda ti makita mi nga umay nga nabartek or nag iinum dtuy kt papanawen mi isuda." (If we see visitors arriving drunk or if they are to drink in this place, we will dismiss them).*

*Informant 2: "Ditoy ket ada metlang ti penalty kada parusa nga kunkuna ta, maikkan ti maysa tao ti kasta nga banag nu talaga nga haan da sumurut kada agtungpal. Ngem diyay ket mangyare laeng depende latta nu kasano kadagsen ti inubra da. Ada diyay first offense kada second offense nga kunkunada". (We can give penalty and punishment to those people who do not really abide by the rules. But it will just happen depending on the severity of their offense).*

*Informant 7: "Mapan da kuma ditoy ta agrelox kada ag ganganas ta na angin met ditoy. Ada gamin metlang dagiyay umumay nga ubraen da ti kaykayat da ket nu kasjay mapilitan kami nga agited ti kasukat na jay inubra da nga madi. Nu medyo mayat pay sige lang ngem nu*

*talaga nadagsenen ket ay diyay a dapat sangwen da jay maited nga kasukat na".* (Visitors must come here to rest and have fun because it's windy here. There are also those who come just to do anything they want to do. And with that, we will be forced to give them the consequences of their actions. If it's bearable, then go ahead but if it's really heavy, they should be ready to face whatever punishment is given).

As stated by the caretakers, they have implemented several norms and policies that would protect the place and the environment. It further noted that if visitors are found out for not abiding by the policies of Mt. Talama, they will have penalties; however, their punishment will then be dependent on their violations. They will be given their first offense penalty, when it's horrendous, they will be provided with the necessary punishment. This suggests that, in order to address the challenges that the caretakers have encountered, they will strictly implement the laws and policies that they have enacted. According to new research, this study affirms that environmental law works to protect land, air, water, and soil. Negligence of these laws results in various punishments like fines, community service, and in some extreme cases, jail time. Without these environmental laws, the government would not be able to punish those who treat the environment poorly (Unity College, 2019). Moreover, according to new research, it is suggested that important measures to alleviate the problem are developing the residents' environmental awareness, proper control on industries, establishing an overall waste collection system, and improving landfill technology (Alemayehu, 2001). The respondents also stated that they do not have the resources to execute other practices that would ensure the place's long-term viability. This implies that they had limited resources which may lead to poor sustainability. Accordingly, Depondt & Green (2006) affirms that due to a lack of funds, marine protected areas (MPAs) around the world have been reported to be failing to meet their conservation goals, leading to management issues such as insufficient law enforcement and poor visitor management.

#### B. Collecting of fees from the violated laws and policies

Penalty is a punishment for breaking the laws and policies. As the informants have mentioned, if visitors violate the laws and policies of Mt. Talama, they will have to pay fines and add them to their funds. Aside from that, the plastic bottles they have collected will then be sold to the junkyard which will be added to their funds.

Some of the verbalizations are as follows:

*Informant 7: "Dagiti ma colcollect mi nga penalties dagijy visitors nga haan tumungtungpal ti laws and policies mi kt mainayund iti pondo.* (The penalties which are collected from those who violated the laws and policies will be added to the funds).

*Informant 2: "Nu mailako mi dagijy plastic bottles nga macolcollect mi ket inayun mi metlang iti pondo"* (If we sell the plastic bottles that we have gathered, it will also be added to our funds).

In addition, any fees collected from visitors who violated Mt. Talama's laws and policies will be added to their funds. According to the caretakers, they are collecting plastic bottles to supplement their funds. Similarly, Depondt & Green (2006) mentioned that user fee systems have been proposed as a solution to MPAs' financial inadequacy, with divers frequently willing to pay large sums of money to help protect the parks they visit.

#### IV. CONCLUSION

Based on the findings of this study, it is concluded that the environmental sustainability practices that Mt. Talama has are proper waste disposal, tree planting, use of solar panel, and partnership with the government. However, Mt. Talama has encountered challenges or issues when implementing these practices, such as visitors' non-compliance with environmental laws and policies and lack of funds for the materials needed to sustain the tourism site. Moreover, it is concluded that in order for the private owner and caretakers to deal with these challenges, the tourism site is guided by environmental laws and policies and imposed penalties and punishment.

#### V. RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the existing environmental sustainability practices of Mt. Talama, the researchers recommend that, with the present practices, new environmental practices be implemented, as the current measures are insufficient to ensure the site's long-term viability. It is further recommended that the owner must allot or outsource more funds to sustain Mt. Talama. Specifically, the researchers suggest that the informants install additional solar panels to save electricity costs. Researchers also recommend recycling other plastic bottles into a flower bed or vase to bring beauty to the environment.

Moreover, with the informants' experiences, the researchers recommend any possible solution to eliminate intoxicated or disobedient visitors by strictly implementing the environmental laws and policies. The researchers further suggest that the Local Government Unit must help develop other sustainable strategies or plans for Mt. Talama. Likewise, the researchers recommend that the tourists and residents adhere to the environmental laws and policies of Mt. Talama towards the sustainability of the place. Furthermore, future researchers may consider using this result as their baseline information about sustainability practices and focus on a broader scope in their future studies. Lastly, in the conduct of future studies, the researchers may also suggest that they will undergo observation method.

## REFERENCES

- Alam, P., & Ahmade, K. (2013). Impact of solid waste on health and the environment. *International Journal of Sustainable Development and Green Economics (IJSDEG)*, 2(1), 165-168.
- Alemayehu, T. (2001). The impact of uncontrolled waste disposal on surface water quality in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *SINET: Ethiopian Journal of Science*, 24(1), 93-104.
- Amasuomo, E., & Baird, J. (2016). The concept of waste and waste management. *J. Mgmt. & Sustainability*, 6, 88.
- Arora, N. K. (2018). Environmental Sustainability—necessary for survival. Retrieved from <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s42398-018-0013-3>
- Bailey, N. J., Barker, A., & MacDonald, K. (1995). *Partnership agencies in British urban policy* (Vol. 6). Taylor & Francis.
- Balasubramanian A. (2019). *Water Conservation Practices*.
- Batista, A. A. D. S., & Francisco, A. C. D. (2018). Organizational sustainability practices: A study of the firms listed by the corporate sustainability index. *Sustainability*, 10(1), 226.
- Buendicho, C. (2018 June 28). Updated Kalinga Tourist Attractions. SCRIBD. Retrieved from: <https://www.scribd.com/document/382780121/Updated-Kalinga-Tourist-Attraction>
- Briones, N. (2005). Environmental Sustainability Issues in Philippine Agriculture. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/6486838.pdf>.
- Chakrabarty, S., & Wang, L. (2012). The long-term sustenance of sustainability practices in MNCs: A dynamic capabilities perspective of the role of R&D and internationalization. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 110(2), 205-217.
- Chan, E. S., Hon, A. H., Okumus, F., & Chan, W. (2017). An empirical study of environmental practices and employee ecological behavior in the hotel industry. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research*, 41(5), 585-608.
- Choudhury, A. R. (2015). Development of eco-labels for sustainable textiles. In *Roadmap to Sustainable Textiles and Clothing* (pp. 137-173). Springer, Singapore.
- Chukwuma S. Ezeonu, R. T. (2012). Biotechnological Tools for Environmental Sustainability: Prospects and Challenges for Environments in Nigeria—A Standard Review. *Biotechnol Res Int.*, 450802.
- Clark, R., Reed, J., & Sunderland, T. (2018). Bridging funding gaps for climate and sustainable development: Pitfalls, progress and potential of private finance. *Land Use Policy*, 71, 335-346.
- Cucculelli, M., & Goffi, G. (2016). Does sustainability enhance tourism destination competitiveness? Evidence from Italian Destinations of Excellence. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 111, 370-382.
- Demirbas, A. (2011). Waste management, waste resource facilities and waste conversion processes. *Energy Conversion and Management*, 52(2), 1280-1287.
- Depondt, F., & Green, E. (2006). Diving user fees and the financial sustainability of marine protected areas: Opportunities and impediments. *Ocean & Coastal Management*, 49(3-4), 188-202.
- Dixit, A., Chaudhary, R. (2020). Sustainability: an Essential Concept for Current and Upcoming Technological Practices. *IOP Conf. Ser.: Mater. Sci. Eng.* 804 012023. Retrieved from <https://iopscience.iop.org/article/10.1088/1757-899X/804/1/012023/pdf>
- ESSC (2012, February 12). Cordillera's forests, green water, and watersheds. Retrieved from: <https://essc.org.ph/content/view/617/153/>
- Ghosh, P., Westhoff, P., & Debnath, D. (2019). Biofuels, food security, and sustainability. In *Biofuels, Bioenergy and Food Security* (pp. 211-229). Academic Press.
- Hendricks B. (2020, February 4). The importance of environmental sustainability in tourism and hospitality. *BIZCOMMUNITY*. Retrieved from: <https://www.bizcommunity.com/Article/196/373/200277.html>
- Heesup Han, L.-T. J.-S. (2011). Are lodging customers ready to go green? An examination of attitudes, demographics, and eco-friendly intentions. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 345-355.
- He, M.-M. G.-Y. (2021). Environmental Regulation, Environmental Awareness and Environmental Governance Satisfaction. *Sustainability*, 13(7), 3960.
- Hussin, J. M., Rahman, I. A., & Memon, A. H. (2013). The way forward in sustainable construction: issues and challenges. *International Journal of Advances in Applied Sciences*, 2(1), 15-24.
- Juarez, A. (2018 April 1). *TABUK, KALINGA: TRAVEL GUIDE, HOW TO GET THERE, WHERE TO STAY, WHAT TO DO AND OTHER TIPS*.
- Lakwatsero. Retrieved from: <https://www.lakwatsero.com/destinations/tabuk/#sthash.xjfZzb1K.ajxDQZ4C.dpbs>
- JR. \*, D. V. (2019). Environmental Awareness and Practices. *International Electronic Journal of Environmental Education*, Vol.9, Issue 2, 2019, 106-119.
- Kaivo-oja, J., Panula-Ontto, J., Vehmas, J., & Luukkanen, J. (2014). Relationships of the dimensions of sustainability as measured by the sustainable society index framework. *International Journal of Sustainable Development & World Ecology*, 21(1), 39-45.
- Khan, M. M. R., & Islam, M. M. (2015). Materials and manufacturing environmental sustainability evaluation of apparel product: knitted T-shirt case study. *Textiles and Clothing Sustainability*, 1(1), 1-12.
- Kotob, F. (2020). What is sustainability. University of Wollongong, Faculty of Business.
- Kuhlman, T., & Farrington, J. (2010). What is sustainability?. *Sustainability*, 2(11), 3436-3448
- Liu, L. (2009). Sustainability: Living within one's own ecological means. *Sustainability*, 1(4), 1412-1430. Retrieved from <https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/1/4/1412/htm>
- Mansbridge, J. (2014). The role of the state in governing the commons. *Environmental Science & Policy*, 36, 8-10.
- Mathew, P. V., & Sreejesh, S. (2017). Impact of responsible tourism on destination sustainability and quality of life of community in tourism destinations. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 31, 83-89.
- Maria de la Cruz del Río-Rama 1, J. A.-G. (2018). Environmental Practices. Motivations and Their influence on the level of implementation. *Sustainability*, 10-703.
- Mensah, J., Casadevall, S. (Reviewing editor) (2019) Sustainable development: Meaning, history, principles, pillars, and implications for human action: Literature review, *Cogent Social Sciences*, 5:1, DOI: 10.1080/23311886.2019.1653531
- Marapara, T. R., Jackson, B. M., Hartley, S., & Maxwell, D. (2021). Disentangling the factors that vary the impact of trees on flooding (a review). *Water and Environment Journal*, 35(2), 514-529.
- Marshall, D., McCarthy, L., Heavey, C., & McGrath, P. (2015). Environmental and social supply chain management sustainability practices: construct development and measurement. *Production Planning & Control*, 26(8), 673-690.
- (Mihai et al., 2012b) Florin Mihai. Tourism implications on local waste management. Case study: Neamț County, Romania. *Present Environment and Sustainable Development*, de Gruyter open, 2013, 7 (1), pp.214-221.
- Minner J. (2011). Beyond the Beach: Balancing Environmental and Socio-cultural Sustainability in Boracay, the Philippines. *Tourism Geographies*, 13:4, 549-569
- Mullis B. (2017, August 10). The growth paradox: can tourism ever be sustainable?. *World Economic Forum*. Retrieved from: <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/08/the-growth-paradox-can-tourism-ever-be-sustainable/>
- Morelli, J. (2011). Environmental sustainability: A definition for environmental professionals. *Journal of environmental sustainability*, 1(1), 2.
- Panwar, N. L., Kaushik, S. C., & Kothari, S. (2011). Role of renewable energy sources in environmental protection: A review. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 15(3), 1513-1524.
- Pettinger, T. (2018 December 20). Environmental sustainability-definition and issues. *Economic.Help*. Retrieved from: <https://www.economicshelp.org/blog/143879/economics/environmental-sustainability-definition-and-issues/>
- Pulido-Fernández, J. I., Cárdenas-García, P. J., & Espinosa-Pulido, J. A. (2019). Does environmental sustainability contribute to tourism growth? An analysis at the country level. *Journal of cleaner production*, 213, 309-319.
- Rahman, H. A. (2020). Malaysian Youth and Environmental Sustainability: A Review. *Perspektif: Jurnal Sains Sosial dan Kemusiaan*, 12(2), 43-54.
- Ribeiro, K., & Dantas, A. (2006). Private-public partnership initiatives around the world: learning from the experience.
- Rodríguez Díaz, M., & Espino Rodríguez, T. F. (2016). Determining the sustainability factors and performance of a tourism destination from the stakeholders' perspective. *Sustainability*, 8(9), 951.
- Rogayan Jr, D. V. (2019). I heart nature: Perspectives of university students on environmental stewardship. *International Journal of Engineering, Science, and Technology*, 1(1), 10-16.

- Salas-Zapata, W. A., Ríos-Osorio, L. A., & Cardona-Arias, J. A. (2018). Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices of Sustainability: Systematic Review 1990-2016. *Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability*, 20(1), 46-63.
- Sariskumar, N., & Bhavan, T. (2018). The impact of responsible tourism on destination sustainability and quality of life in Passikudah tourism destination. *International Journal of Social Science and Economic Research*, 3(11), 5933-5959.
- Sphera (2020, May 19). What is environmental Sustainability Retrieved from: <https://sphera.com/glossary/what-is-environmental-sustainability/>
- Shanti, J. (2016). A study on environmental sustainability practices of star hotels in Bangalore. *Asian Journal of Business Ethics*, 185--194.
- Sourani, A., & Sohail, M. (2011, December). Barriers to addressing sustainable construction in public procurement strategies. In *Proceedings of the Institution of Civil Engineers-Engineering Sustainability* (Vol. 164, No. 4, pp. 229-237). Thomas Telford Ltd.
- Stojanović et al. (2018). Importance of Environmental Sustainability For Business Sustainability. 8th International Conference on Environmental and Material Flow Management, B&H, 14-16.
- Unity College (2019, March 27). What is the importance of environmental Law? Retrieved from <https://unity.edu/environmental-careers/what-is-the-importance-of-environmental-law/>
- Vellecco, I., & Mancino, A. (2010). Sustainability and tourism development in three Italian destinations: stakeholders' opinions and behaviours. *The Service Industries Journal*, 30(13), 2201-2223.
- Wan Kalthom, Y. (2020). Engaging youth participation in making sustainability work. Leal Filho W, Wall T, Azul AM, Brandli L, and Özuyar PG (eds). *Good Health and Well-Being*. New York: Springer International Publishing, 1–10.
- Yahya, W. K., Musa, N. D., & Hashim, N. H. (2016). Understanding Environmentally Friendly Consumer Behavior. In *Regional Conference on Science, Technology and Social Sciences (RCSTSS 2014)* (pp. 909-921). Springer, Singapore.
- Zolfani, S. H., Sedaghat, M., Maknoon, R., & Zavadskas, E. K. (2015). Sustainable tourism: a comprehensive literature review on frameworks and applications. *Economic Research-Ekonomska Istraživanja*, 28(1), 1-30.

# Assessment of Kalesa as Tourism Transportation In Tuguegarao City

**Ma. Mercedes Bayo<sup>1</sup>**

*Tourism Management Program  
School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Koleen Eliza Gonzaga<sup>4</sup>**

*Tourism Management Program  
School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Karen Mae Callueng<sup>2</sup>**

*Tourism Management Program  
School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Lyka Mae Guzman<sup>5</sup>**

*Tourism Management Program  
School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Hannah Lei Delas Alas<sup>3</sup>**

*Tourism Management Program  
School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Fe Rose-Anne Maramag<sup>6</sup>**

*School of Accountancy, Business and Hospitality  
University of Saint Louis  
Tuguegarao City, Cagayan*

**Abstract**— The launch of the heritage tour by the city tourism office made kalesa more recognized in the city. In addition, kalesa is becoming popular as a transportation mode and an additional attraction. This study assessed the visitors' expectations and experience satisfaction with kalesa as tourism transportation in Tuguegarao City. Descriptive quantitative research method was used. A field and technical expert validated the questionnaires where google forms were utilized to gather data from the participants. A total of 46 respondents answered the questionnaire. Data were then analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. The profile of the respondents was analyzed using frequency and percentage. The assessment of kalesa as tourism transportation was analyzed using mean. Lastly, T-Test, ANOVA, and Pearson Correlation Coefficient were used to test the hypotheses. The results of the study revealed that the strong point for the expectation of the kalesa ride experience in the city was mainly focused on the excitement factor. Experience satisfaction in the aspect of comfortability, capacity of the kalesa, safety and security, pricing, and condition of the kalesa is equal to its expectation. Moreover, the kalesa's cleanliness was considered a concern for immediate attention and enhancement. Visitors were satisfied but needed improvement in all areas. The Local Government Unit (LGU) may use the findings of this study in collaboration with the City Tourism Office of Tuguegarao in the proceeding ordinance concerning the use of kalesa as tourism transportation.

**Keywords**— *Tourism Transportation, Kalesa, Expectation, Experience Satisfaction, Kutsero*

## I. INTRODUCTION

The movement of people from one place to another, typically for leisure, is referred to as tourism. In the Philippines, the tourism industry is very important to the country's economy. The transportation sector is one of the numerous sectors which makes up the tourism industry and contributes to the nation's economic growth. Regarding the transportation sector, it is a vital aspect of the success of the tourism industry (Westcott, 2015).

According to Montefalcon et al. (2018), kalesa (horse-drawn carriage), one of the country's earliest forms of transportation, has since developed into an icon of Filipino cultural heritage and a popular tourist attraction in some regions. Transport vehicle kalesa has been one of the key components of tourism transportation in some parts of the Philippines, including Tuguegarao City. The kalesa transports its city visitors or tourists from one tourist destination to another, such as St. Peter Metropolitan Cathedral, San Jacinto Church, Rizal Park, Cagayan Provincial Museum, and Spanish Port/Horno. Aside from its physical presence in Tuguegarao, kalesa profoundly impacts the Filipino people's identity and beliefs.

The discussion of kalesa as tourism transportation can extend to transportation per se. Van Truong and Shimizu (2017) mentioned that transportation is vital to economic growth and tourism. One of the key factors affecting how convenient it is to use public transportation via bus is comfort (Dell'Olio et al., 2011), to which Imre and Dilay (2016) have agreed. On the other

hand, Tan (2020) showed that tourist satisfaction is vital for the evaluation of transport performance, and existing transport modes in the destination will affect tourist movement.

In the Philippines, the existence of *kalesa* can be traced as a mode of transportation centuries ago, and its significance to history and culture is worthy of appreciation and preservation (Manugas et al., 2015). Being a *kutsero* (the operator of *kalesa*) was inherited across generations, and part of a *kutsero*'s inheritance was the cart and the horse they used. As a mode of transportation in Tuguegarao City, *kalesa* is timely, environment-friendly, and regarded as one way of honoring their past heritage (Lagasca, 2008). In 2017, it was 55 years after then-President Diosdado Macapagal rode a *kalesa*. Tuguegarao's *kalesa* had outlived most of its patrons and still refused to leave the streets goodbye. *Kalesa* is a local mode of transportation that has never seen bad days and continues to play its role to the fullest. The rapid transition of the Tuguegarao *kalesa* from a lowly mode of public transportation to a symbol of Cagayano culture is significant. It is utilized in agriculture, business, trade and industry, sociocultural and religious events and activities, and even as a political instrument (De Yro, 2017).

As early as the 1960s, *kalesa* has been operating in Tuguegarao City and, until now, refused to leave the streets behind. When Tuguegarao City's small streets could not handle the increasing number of tricycles in the early 2000s, a proposal to ban the *kalesa* was devised. Through this, the Sangguniang Panlungsod adopted an ordinance allowing transportation on minor streets only for its cultural significance and image value rather than prohibiting its use altogether (De Yro, 2017). However, frequent usage caused the carriage degradation, putting quality service and experience at danger.

Rather than safety and cleanliness, tourists place more value on the comfort, excitement, price, and capacity of tourist transportation (Robles et al., 2021). However, the study of Robles et al. (2021) is limited only to Intramuros, Manila. Still, operators must address service quality and perceived value to enhance visitor satisfaction (Lai & Chen, 2011).

Over the years, *kalesa* has become a mode of travel and tourism in Tuguegarao City, and only few studies have been conducted to assess *kalesa* in this locality. With the *kalesa* in its current state, expectations may be lower than what tourists experience (Robles et al., 2021). These research gaps urged the researchers to assess *kalesa* as tourism transportation in Tuguegarao City. This study assessed the visitors' expectations and experience satisfaction with *kalesa* as a tourism transportation in Tuguegarao City. Specifically, this study aimed to determine the (1) profile of the respondents, (2) expectation and experience satisfaction of visitors on *kalesa* as tourism transportation within Tuguegarao City, (3) significant difference in the assessment of visitors' expectations of *kalesa* as tourism transportation when grouped according to profile, (4) significant difference in the assessment of visitor's experience satisfaction on *kalesa* as tourism transportation when grouped according to profile, and (5) significant relationship between the expectation and experience satisfaction of the visitors to *kalesa* in Tuguegarao City.

## II. METHODS

The research utilized a quantitative research method implying descriptive research design. The study was administered in Tuguegarao City, Cagayan. The respondents of the study were the visitors in Tuguegarao City from June to September who were selected based on the following requirements: (1) the respondent must not be a local of Tuguegarao City, (2) the respondent is any person visiting any heritage destination in Tuguegarao, and (3) the respondent must have utilized *kalesa* when visiting the destination. The respondents were chosen through a random sampling technique. The study used a google form questionnaire to gather the data needed. The content of the survey is divided into two (2) parts: Part I consists of the profile of the respondents in terms of their age, gender, place of origin, and the destination/s visited. Part II contains the gathered information about visitors' assessment of *kalesa* as a tourism transportation which consists of the factors for level of expectation and experience satisfaction. This part of the questionnaire was answerable by a 5-point Likert scale which was modified from the study of Robles et al. (2019). The questionnaire underwent content validation among field and technical experts.

The researchers asked permission from the Vice-President for Academics thru the Academic Dean of the School of Accountancy, Business, and Hospitality on the conduct of the study. After the permission was granted, the researchers administered the approved questionnaire. Moreover, the researchers wrote a letter to the city tourism office in Tuguegarao City, asking for assistance in gathering information on tourists as respondents in the study. The city tourism office approved the communication letter, which was then forwarded to the head of the Cagayan Provincial Museum.

The respondents were obtained from the Cagayan Provincial Museum's tourist logbook. The contact information was written in the logbook to communicate the research questionnaires to the respondents. The researchers administered the questionnaires to the target respondents through google forms, and with an informed consent form. Additionally, the number of respondents who answered the questionnaire needed to be increased; thus, the researchers floated questionnaires to their relatives, friends, and acquaintances who were qualified by the requirements as respondents of the study. After the data was gathered, it was analyzed and interpreted.

The data gathered was analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. The profile of the respondents was analyzed using frequency and percentage. The assessment of *kalesa* as tourist transportation was analyzed using mean. Lastly, T-Test, ANOVA and Pearson Correlation Coefficient were used to test the hypotheses. To measure the respondents' expectation and experience satisfaction, a 5-point Level of Expectation and Experience Satisfaction was used, as shown in the table.

Scale	Range	Level of Expectation	Level of Satisfaction
5	4.50-5.00	Very High Expectation	Very Satisfied
4	3.50-4.49	Above Average Expectation	Moderately Satisfied
3	2.50-3.49	Average Expectation	Slightly Satisfied
2	1.50-2.49	Below Average Expectation	Dissatisfied
1	1.00-1.49	Very Low Expectation	Very Dissatisfied

### III. RESULTS

TABLE I. PROFILE OF THE HOTELS

Variables	Categories	Frequency	Percentage
Age	13-19 years old	7	15.2
	20-39 years old	38	82.6
	40 and above	1	2.2
	Average Age	27.64	100
Gender	Male	17	37
	Female	29	63
	Total	46	100
Place of Origin	Cagayan	21	45.7
	Isabela	23	50
	Kalinga	1	2.2
	Vigan City	1	2.2
	Total	46	100
Destination/s Visited	St. Peter Metropolitan Cathedral	28	33.3
	San Jacinto Church	6	7.1
	Rizal Park	35	41.5
	Cagayan Provincial Museum	13	15
	The Spanish Port/Horno	2	2.4

The table reveals that the average age is twenty-seven out of all the respondents. As to gender, there are more female visitors who visited and experienced riding a *Kalesa*. It also shows that most of the visitors came from Isabela between the month of June to September 2022. Multiple answers were accepted in terms of the respondents' destination/s visited, with the majority of them visiting Rizal Park.

TABLE II. VISITOR'S ASSESSMENT ON THEIR EXPECTATION AND EXPERIENCE SATISFACTION OF KALESA AS TOURISM TRANSPORTATION IN TUGUEGARAO CITY

Variables	Level of Expectation		Level of Experience Satisfaction	
	Mean	Qualitative Description	Mean	Qualitative Description
Comfortability	3.92	Above Average Expectation	3.83	Moderately Satisfied
Capacity of the <i>Kalesa</i>	4.13	Above Average Expectation	4.09	Moderately Satisfied
Excitement Factor	4.53	Very High Expectation	4.45	Moderately Satisfied
Safety and Security	4.39	Above Average Expectation	4.40	Moderately Satisfied
Pricing	4.22	Above Average Expectation	4.14	Moderately Satisfied

Cleanliness of the <i>Kalesa</i>	3.54	Above Average Expectation	3.41	Slightly Satisfied
Condition of the <i>Kalesa</i>	4.03	Above Average Expectation	4.10	Moderately Satisfied
Overall mean	4.11	Above Average Expectation	4.06	Moderately Satisfied

The table revealed that the excitement factor to *kalesa* as a tourism transportation in Tuguegarao Cit had very high expectation and satisfaction from visitors. It means that the visitors have very high expectations and are satisfied with *kalesa* in providing a unique experience to visitors, and the *kutsero* being jolly enough while bringing the visitors to their destination.

Furthermore, comfortability, capacity of the *kalesa*, safety and security, pricing, and condition of the *kalesa* had high expectation and satisfaction from the visitors. It means that the visitors had high expectations and were satisfied with the seats of *kalesa* having a comfortable seat covered with foam, and being spacious enough for a group of 4 to 6 persons. Likewise, the visitors are satisfied because of the following reasons: the *kutsero* makes the visitors feel safe in the *kalesa* and is safe for the ride; the *kalesa* offers an affordable fare matrix and not overcharges the visitors; the *kalesa* has a pleasant smell and has a trash bin inside; and the *kalesa* is pleasing to the eyes of the visitors and is well furnished inside. On the other hand, the cleanliness of the *kalesa* had high expectation yet was slightly satisfied. It means that the visitors expected the *kalesa* to have a pleasant smell. Although a trash bin inside the carriage was made available, they were slightly satisfied.

TABLE III. SIGNIFICANT DIFFERENCE IN THE ASSESSMENT OF VISITORS' EXPECTATION ON KALESA AS TOURISM TRANSPORTATION IN TUGUEGARAO CITY WHEN GROUPED ACCORDING TO PROFILE VARIABLES

Profile Variables	T-value/F-value	P-value	Description
Age	3.223	.079	Not Significant
Gender	.648	.520	Not Significant
Place of Origin	.936	.432	Not Significant
Destination Visited such as St. Peter Metropolitan Cathedral	-2.021	.049	Significant
Visited - 3.95			
Not Visited - 4.36			
San Jacinto Church	.485	.630	Not Significant
Rizal Park	-.825	.414	Not Significant
Cagayan Provincial Museum	.812	.421	Not Significant
The Spanish Port/Horno	.291	.772	Not Significant

Table 3 shows no significant difference between the expectation and the profile variables of age, gender, place of origin, and destination/s visited, namely San Jacinto Church, Rizal Park, Cagayan Provincial Museum, and Spanish Port/Horno. This means that the profile variables are not related to the visitors' expectation of *kalesa* as tourism transportation